



P. P. Carpenter's 1857 "Mazatlan Catalogue"

Richard E. Petit¹ & A. N. van der Bijl²

¹806 Saint Charles Road, North Myrtle Beach, SC 29582, U.S.A. email: r.e.petit@att.net

²NCB Naturalis, P.O. Box 9517, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands email: bram.vanderbijl@ncbnaturalis.nl

Introduction

The *Catalogue of the collection of Mazatlan shells, in the British Museum: collected by Frederick Reigen, or Catalogue of the Reigen collection of Mazatlan Mollusca, in the British Museum*, written by Philip Pearsall Carpenter (1819–1877) is a seminal work on the Mollusca of western Mexico, still consulted today for its descriptions of new taxa and for the first records from Mexico for previously described taxa. This book has been the source of conflicting information about its editions, dating, publisher and place of publication. This paper provides definitive answers to resolve these bibliographic problems.

The Catalogue

This book was published under two titles. The differences between the editions, primarily the title and the preface, are minor and do not affect the systematic portion of the work. The two "editions" correctly cited are:

1857. *Catalogue of the collection of Mazatlan shells, in the British Museum: collected by Frederick Reigen*. London: Printed by order of the Trustees. 1857. [i]–iv (Preface signed by John Edward Gray), [ix]–xvi, [1]–552. [1857c herein]

1857. *Catalogue of the Reigen collection of Mazatlan Mollusca, in the British Museum*. Warrington: Printed at the Oberlin Press, by

P. P. Carpenter. 1855–7. [i]–viii (Preface signed by Philip P. Carpenter), [v]–xii, [1]–552. [1857d herein]

Page [i] in both is the Title Page, on the verso of which is "Printed by P. P. Carpenter, Oberlin Press, Warrington" in 1857c; that data appearing on the recto of the 1857d title page.

Kabat (1989: 113) stated that [1857d] "was simultaneously printed ... on different paper of a larger size." A partially uncut signature of part of the 1857d Preface, indicates that this part of his report, based on information supplied by one of us [REP], was flawed, and the perceived size difference is actually an artifact of trimming. More than one kind of paper may have been used.

Prefaces

The Preface in 1857c is almost entirely in quotation marks and is taken from pages i, ii, vii, and viii of the Preface in 1857d. Gray added only one paragraph in which he stated that: (1) the collection was presented to the Museum by Carpenter; (2) Carpenter's "Descriptive Catalogue" is here printed; and (3) "the descriptions of the Bryozoa, occupying the first six pages, were kindly communicated by G. Busk, Esq. F.R.S., &c."

The 1857c Preface pages [ix]–xvi are identical to 1857d pages [v]–xii. Only the signed sections of the Prefaces differ.

Printer

Carpenter had his church purchase a printing press as a means of teaching local youth a skill and also to print literature of interest to him. This was the Oberlin Press “on which he printed for himself and other reformers tracts and extended papers on sanitation, teetotalism, religious and school reports, or anything which Carpenter believed would better human conduct and conditions of life.”

(Palmer, 1958: 9). Much more information about the Oberlin Press and P. P. Carpenter may be found in the biography by his brother, Russell Lane Carpenter (1880).

That all copies of both editions were printed by the Oberlin Press is demonstrated by the presence of its name. It is on the verso of the title page of one [1857c], the position where the printer’s name appears on other British Museum Catalogues and was usually Taylor and Francis, London. In the other edition [1857d] the name of the press appears on the recto of the title page and is thus not needed on the verso. That they were printed at the same time is stated by Carpenter himself (see quote under Editions below).

Date of publication

The first page of each 12 page signature is dated, the dates starting with July 1855 and ending with June 1857. The presence of these dates led some workers (e.g., Bartsch, 1915: 34) to cite them as the publication date for new taxa. Bartsch’s statement was countered by Iredale (1916: 36) who pointed out that these dates referred “to the proof-sheets, not to the publication.” Iredale’s paper was overlooked by Keen (1958: 561) who wrote: “each part dated at foot of first page.” She later became aware of Iredale’s paper (Keen 1961: 211) and the dates were corrected in the second edition of her major work (Keen 1971).

Clapp & Kenk (1963: 202) listed the Catalogue as being in two editions, the first dated 1855–57 published in Warrington. They

showed the dates as “p. 1–120, 1855; p. 121–444, 1856; p. 445–552, 1857.” The second edition was listed as published: “London: British Museum (Natural History), [1855–]1857.” Subsequent authors citing Clapp & Kenk (e.g., Kleemann, 1983: 4) have accordingly misdated Carpenter species. These signature dates were also incorrectly used by Ruhoff (1980) in her list of molluscan species described between 1850 and 1870.

The Preface in both editions is dated April 22nd, 1857. The Catalogue was referenced by Carpenter in papers read at the Zoological Society in July 1856 (Carpenter 1857a, b) complete with page numbers and species numbers but without descriptions.

Sherborn (1934: 310) determined the actual date of publication to be 1 August 1857, which Kabat (1989) used. However, Sherborn’s basis for dating the various Catalogues of the Museum was, in his words, a matter of inference:

“At this distance of time it is impossible to recover the exact day on which they were offered for public sale, and we must be contented to recover the exact day on which they were ‘laid upon the table’ of the Trustees, a preliminary to the issue to the public.” – Sherborn (1926: 27)

As there was no obvious constraint on Carpenter’s delivery of copies of the Catalogue, and given his citation of it in earlier papers, there is no reason to suppose that he delayed distribution after the final printing in June. However, if proofs for the last signature, dated June 1857, were sent out for comment that would have caused a delay. The errata pages do make a correction in that final signature. Also, the work would have to be assembled and bound before distribution. Fortunately there are no time sensitive nomenclatural acts in the Catalogue that would be affected by a change of a month or

two. It is here recommended that Sherborn's date of 1 August 1857 be considered the date of publication of both editions.

Editions

Although Iredale correctly treated the signature dates, he misinterpreted them.

According to him (1916: 36) the "edition published at Warrington" was printed "later than the London edition, and the dates refer only to the proof-sheets." Why he thought that proof-sheets would be issued for a later printing is not understood, especially as all copies have the same signature dates. All copies of this work were printed at Warrington.

Galbraith & Dance (1961: 11) stated that the Mazatlan Catalogue "had already been printed by Carpenter himself at Warrington, Lancashire, England. Carpenter issued some copies [1857d] which differ from the British Museum publication [1857c] in title page and preface only." This is incorrect and potentially misleading as it implies that Carpenter did not print the "British Museum publication" version, or that the two were printed at different times.

It is clear that two editions exist with different titles as listed by Kabat (1989). As there is nothing nomenclatural or taxonomic in the Prefaces, it does not matter which is consulted or cited. The work was reprinted by Palmer at the Paleontological Research Institution in 1967. In a foreword to the reprint she commented that: "The two editions are alike except in the title page and preface. To furnish that complete data the two title pages and prefaces are included herein. Readers should realize the proper sequence of those pages."

Original copies also exist with both title pages. One at hand was the copy Palmer used when she was working on Carpenter material but it is not the copy from which the P. R. I. reprint was made. The locality of that

copy is not known and it may or may not have actually contained both. A second copy with both title pages is in the library of M. Hollmann, but it does not contain the Preface pages [ix]–xvi for 1857d. In preparing this paper the pagination of 20 copies was obtained. Deducting the two with dual title pages already mentioned, 10 are 1857c and 8 are 1857d. This indicates that the distribution of copies by Carpenter was broader than he indicated. Fifteen years later he stated his reason for the Warrington printing, to present with the duplicate collections:

"First Edition, with Preface as arranged by Dr. J. E. Gray, on sale at the British Museum, price 8s. Second Edition, with Author's Preface, accompanying duplicate collections of the shells, published simultaneously." – Carpenter (1872: xi)

Even Carpenter's description is misleading since it implies that the version with Gray's preface was the "first" edition, yet Gray's preface is almost entirely composed of quotes from Carpenter's preface. As they were simultaneously published neither is "first" but to provide a means of differentiating the printings we will maintain Carpenter's arrangement. Also, although Carpenter implied that the edition with his own preface was intended to accompany the "duplicate collections of shells," it is unlikely that he printed only one copy for each collection given that at least 8 copies are extant today.

That the two editions were printed simultaneously as stated by Carpenter is reinforced by a typographical error that is not consistent. The name of the printer appears on the bottom of page 522. In some copies the "ngton" in Warrington has been dropped, rendering the place of publication as "Warri", an error noted in four copies, two of each edition.

As often happens when changes are made in a text, errors result. One such instance is the corruption of page number 205 to 255.

This has been noted only in the “Warri” copy at hand and the 1967 reprint. It has not been searched for elsewhere.

Proof Pages

A unique copy of 1857d in the library of the second author contains signatures that were mailed out by Carpenter for review and returned with notations and comments. These pre-publication proofs are unusual as Carpenter had his request for comments imprinted on the first page of the signatures. This imprint had to be taken out before printing, of course. As this “proof” copy is incomplete it is not known if all signatures were so treated, but an imprinted request of some type appears on pages 25, 37, 73, 133, 137, 169, 205, 241, 265, 289, 313, 481, 493, usually at the top of the page. All of these printed requests for review are on the first page of signatures with the exception of one on page 137 which is the query: “Which abbreviation do you prefer : the common Sow. or Gould’s Sby. like Dkr. Mke. &c.” The proof pages were set as “Sby.” but it was changed to “Sow.” perhaps due to “I prefer Sow.” being A. Adams’ comment. Holograph markings and comments appear on many of the proof pages. In addition to corrections marked by Carpenter, comments were made by Arthur Adams, William Baird, and John Edward Gray. Some of these are reproduced herein (Figure 1). Comparison of the proof sheets and the final text shows that most changes were minor but extensive changes were required in a few instances.

Plates

The original 60 plates drawn by Carpenter for his *Mazatlan Shells* were published by Brann (1966).

Acknowledgements

Appreciation is expressed to those who provided collations of copies in their institutions or their own libraries: Eugene V. Coan, Jochen Gerber, Lindsey T. Groves, Michael Hollmann, Paula M. Mikkelsen, Robert Moore, Richard W. Negus, Paul Valentich-Scott, Charles F. Sturm, and John K. Tucker. On-line copies belonging to the Smithsonian Institution, the University of California Libraries, and the University of Toronto were also consulted.

We wish to thank Eugene V. Coan and Alan R. Kabat for reviewing this paper. Their comments and suggestions have been most helpful.

References Cited

- Bartsch, P. (1915) The recent and fossil mollusks of the genus *Rissoina* from the west coast of America. *Proceedings of the United States National Museum*, 49(2094), 33–62, pls. 28–33.
- Brann, D. C. (1966) *Illustrations to “Catalogue of the Collection of Mazatlan Shells” by Philip P. Carpenter*. Paleontological Research Institution, Ithaca. 111 pp. [incl. pls. 1–60].
- Carpenter, P. P. (1857a) Monograph of the shells collected by T. Nuttall, Esq., on the Californian coast, in the years 1834–5. *Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London*, 24, 209–229. (26 January)
- Carpenter, P. P. (1857b) First steps toward a monograph of the recent species of *Petalconchus*, a genus of Vermetidae. *Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London*, 24, 313–317. (10 March)
- Carpenter, P. P. (1857c) *Catalogue of the collection of Mazatlan shells, in the British Museum: collected by Frederick Reigen*. London: Printed by order of the Trustees. 1857. [i]–iv (Preface signed John Edward Gray), [ix]–xvi, [1]–552.

- Carpenter, P. P. (1857d) *Catalogue of the Reigen collection of Mazatlan Mollusca, in the British Museum*. Warrington: Printed at the Oberlin Press, by P. P. Carpenter. 1855–7. [i]–viii (Preface signed Philip P. Carpenter), [v]–xii, [1]–552.
- Carpenter, P. P. (1872) The mollusks of western North America. *Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collections*, 252, i–xii, 1–325, 13–121 (index).
- Carpenter, R. L. (1880) *Memoirs of the life and work of Philip Pearsall Carpenter, B.A., London, Ph.D., New York, chiefly derived from his letters*. C. Kegan Paul & Co., London. viii + 360 pp.
- Clapp, W. F. & Kenk, R. (1963) *Marine borers. An annotated bibliography*. Office of Naval Research, Washington. xii + 1136 pp.
- Galbraith, I. C. J. & Dance, S. P. (1961) [Carpenter and the] British Museum (Natural History). *American Malacological Union Bulletin*, 27 [= *Annual Reports for 1960*], 10–12.
- Iredale, T. (1916) On some new and old molluscan generic names. *Proceedings of the Malacological Society of London*, 12(1), 27–37.
- Kabat, A. R. (1989) The “Gray Catalogues” [Mollusca] of the British Museum. *The Nautilus*, 103(3), 113–115.
- Keen, A. M. (1958) *Sea shells of tropical west America*. Stanford University Press, Stanford. viii + 624 pp., 10 pls.
- Keen, A. M. (1961) A proposed reclassification of the gastropod family Vermetidae. *Bulletin of the British Museum (Natural History), Zoology*, 7(3), 183–213, pls. 54–55.
- Keen, A.M. (1971) *Sea shells of tropical west America. Second edition*. Stanford University Press, Stanford. xiv + 1064 pp., 22 pls.
- Kleemann, K. H. (1983) Catalogue of recent and fossil *Lithophaga* (Bivalvia). *Journal of Molluscan Studies, Supplement*, 12, 1–46.
- Palmer, K. V. W. (1958) Type specimens of marine Mollusca described by P. P. Carpenter from the West coast (San Diego to British Columbia). *The Geological Society of America, Memoir*, 76, i–vi, 1–376.
- Ruhoff, F.A. (1980) Index to species of Mollusca introduced from 1850 to 1870. *Smithsonian Contributions to Zoology*, 294, i–ii, 1–640.
- Sherborn, C. D. (1926) Date of publication of early Catalogues of Natural History issued by the British Museum. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History*, ser. 9, 17(100), 271–272.
- Sherborn, C. D. (1934) Date of publication of Catalogues of Natural History (post 1850) issued by the British Museum. *Annals and Magazine of Natural History*, ser. 10, 13(74), 308–312.

brother J. have directed another to your
 PROOF. Have the kindness to return, with any corrections, to
 P. F. Carpenter, Oberlin Press, Warrington, WITHOUT DELAY.

MAZATLAN UNIVALVES 241

300. VITRINELLA LINCOLNATA, n. s.

V. t. discoides, haud parva, anfructibus iv. et dimidio.
 quarum tres insculpti, regulariter angulosis, spiraliter tenuer
 lypatis; spirâ planâ, subaria conspicua, aperturâ rotundatâ,
 umbilico maximo, anfructus monstrante.

Area Lin. (founder on A. Noo) is the course
 come for this group. If not Area the next in
 Navicula Blainv. non spica. Cebota Pan
 older than Navicula as also is Rafines
 These shells you call Area and Scaphara Gray
 A. Adams

GENUS BYSSOARCA, Swains.

Area, sp. typ. Linn., auct. — Navicula, Blainv. 1818 (teste
 Gray). — Byssosarca, Swains. 1825.

The genus was spelled earlier
 by me from the operculum but the
 M. viviana in name should be
 applied to shell

MAZATLAN UNIVALVES 487

The true *M. vitaliana*, Lam. appears to be an African shell
 closely resembling but distinct from the very variable species
 of W. America. The Mazatlan specimens are very rarely
 white, or banded with purple brown; but almost always of an
 ochraceous tint, especially at the border of the mouth, which is
 white within. Shape generally with the spire moderately
 elevated, sometimes turritid, sometimes depressed and pyrri-
 form. Upper whorls angular, generally flattened, with regular
 varical ridges as in Trophon. Nuclear whorls smooth, turritid,
 fixed slanting, duculata. Normal whorls subrotund, generally
 developing a row of obtuse nodules on the shoulder, which some-
 times elongate into faint costae. Varieties foliaceous, extremely
 irregular, rarely seen on the spire, from one to six on the last
 whorl, at variable distances. Labium smooth, with an infra-
 natural tooth as in Pisania. Canal more or less elongate. The
 creature appears to be of sluggish habits, being frequently
 worn eaten, and encrusted with Bryozoa, &c. though not with
 corallinae. It is very rarely pierced by Lithophagus and Gas-
 trochona. The operculum is dimid-shaped, with two short
 sides above, and two long ones below, angles rounded; outside
 with ridges of growth; inside with a very large muscular scar,
 reddish, corrugated, with a few lines of growth; a loose yel-
 lowish border is seen round the outer edge. The largest sp.
 measures — long, 3.84, long. spir. 1.4, lat. 2.1, dia. 6.3.
 An elevated sp. " 3.84, " 1.03, " 1.8, " 4.9.
 A pyriform sp. " 2.95, " .77, " 1.7, " 8.0.

Hab. — S. America, Sverby, Duhayon. — Panama; under
 stones, not far from low water mark; C. B. Adams. — Maz-
 atlan; not uncommon; Lippold & Howe Coll.

Tablet 2287 contains 4 sp. adolescent. — 2288, 3 sp. single
 varix, depressed. — 2289, 3 do. normal. — 2290, 2 do. elevated. —
 2291, 3 sp. with 2 varices, depressed. — 2292, 2 do. normal. —
 2293, 2 do. elevated. — 2294, 3 sp. normal, varices 3 or more. —
 2295, 2 do. elevated varices 3 or 5. — 2296, 4 sp. showing changes
 of colour. — 2297, 3 do. showing extremes of sculpture. — 2298,
 1 sp. elongated canal. — 2299, the largest sp. stout columellar
 callosity, apparently deposited as a guard against worms. —
 2300, an elongated sp. with a similar callosity. — 2301, a sp. with
 fresh canal after fracture, bent as in Cassidaria. — 2302, a sp.
 which, in mending a hole between two varices, has protuded a
 second lip, with a passage to the inside (as in Trochotomus). —
 2303, 3 separate opercula. The youngest sp. in tablet 2287,
 and one in tablet 2297 have their opercula in situ.

Why not from operculum?

MAZATLAN UNIVALVES 487

GENUS NITIDELLA, Swains.

Nitidella, Swains, diagn. auct.
 Buccinum, pars, Lam.
 Columbella, pars, auct.

Testa ut in Mitrella (Risso, non Swains, H. & A. Ad. Gen.
 vol. i. p. 183) interdum decollata; labio continuo, haud crenato.
 Operculum elongatum, sulco laterali, ut in Purpurâ formatum.

The operculum of the following species being distinctly
 Purpuroid, as observed in five specimens, it is necessary to
 remove it from both Buccinum and Columbella; and as none
 of the genera in Purpuridae seem constituted so as to receive it,
 the above name (given however from the shell alone) is adopted
 by Dr. Gray. It did not seem expedient to adopt the group
 of Messrs. Adams, till the opercula of other species had been
 examined; nor to draw out a more precise diagnosis, till it
 was known how far the peculiarities of *B. cribrarium* were of
 specific or of generic value.

613. NITIDELLA CRIBRARIA.

Buccinum cribrarium, Lam. An. x. Vest. vol. x. p. 176,
 no. 43. — Quoy & Gaim. Voy. de l'Astr. Zool. vol. ii. p. 321,
 pl. 30, f. 21, 22. — Kien. Icon Conch. p. 45, no. 44, pl. 16, f. 57.
 Columbella cribraria, Sw. Thes. Conch. p. 120, no. 51, pl. 37,
 f. 112, 113. — Desh. in Lam. loc. cit. — Gray in Zool. Beech.
 Voy. p. 120. — B. M. Cat. Conch. Moll. p. 27, no. 316. — Moe.
 (Conch. St. Vinc.) in Zeit. f. Nat. 1853, p. 75.
 (Columbella) Mitrella cribraria, H. & A. Ad. Gen. i. 183.
 = Voluta ocellata, Gmel. p. 3455.
 = L. Barnet, Adams. Sinea, p. 146, pl. 10, f. 1.
 = Buccinum parvulum, Des. in Zeit. f. Nat. 1847, p. 64. —
 Phil. Abbild. iii. pl. 2, f. 7.
 = C. mitriformis, Brod. & King, Zool. Journ. — Lister, Conch.
 pl. 929, f. 24. (teste Gray.)
 = C. guttata, Sw. Proc. Zool. Soc. 1832, p. 118. — Müll. Sga.
 Nov. Test. Vic. p. 83. — C. B. Ad. Pan. Shells, p. 80, no. 89. —
 (Non Sw. Proc. Zool. Soc. 1844, p. 55; — Thes. Conch.
 p. 131, no. 59, pl. 33, f. 124; = C. punctata, do. index, p. 146.)

This well marked form appears to be very widely diffused.
 The Pacific type is of course regarded by Prof. Adams as
 distinct from the Caribbean, as it was at first by Sowerby. It

In my work which you read is
 My words exactly express your idea. 1877

Fig. 1. Selected emendations to the proofs by reviewers.

NOTE

Although no nomenclatural action is taken in this paper, this note is to declare that it is being published for the permanent scientific record and copies are being sent to numerous systematists and institutions. It is being reproduced in ink on paper in over fifty simultaneously produced identical copies. It is also being made available as an electronic file.

Conchologia Ingrata is available without charge.

Back issues of *Conchologia Ingrata*

Available free of charge

from <http://conchologia.com>

- No. 1. Petit, R. E. 2008. ICZN Article 9.1 – Why? 4 pp.
- No. 2. Petit, R. E. & Callomon, P. 2009. The distressing case of *Polyhomoa itoi* Azuma, 1949 and *Kyidris mutica* Brown, 1949. 4 pp.
- No. 3. Petit, R. E. 2011. Reprint of Lamarck's 1816 "Liste des objets". 19 pp.
- No. 4. Petit, R. E. 2011. A review of *Rare and Unusual Shells of the Florida Keys and Adjacent Areas* by Edward J. Petuch and Dennis M. Sargent, 2011. 5 pp.
- No. 5. Petit, R. E. & Tucker, J. K. 2011. A name too far. (Review of "Taxonomic review of the *Conus spectrum*, *Conus stramineus* and *Conus collisus* complexes (Gastropoda – Conidae) – Part I" by R. M. Filmer, 2011). 6 pp.
- No. 6. Matsukuma, A. 2012. Index to mollusks in *Tableau Encyclopédique et Méthodique*, part 23, pls. 391-488 by J. B. P. A. Lamarck. 10 pp.